Understanding Media Habits & Engaging Latino Communities

Professors Jonathan Nagler & Marisa Abrajano
April 15, 2024
Motivation

- There are widespread reports that Latinos are being targeted with misinformation, in both English and Spanish.

- Latinos may be particularly likely to encounter misinformation as content moderation on social media is generally worse in non-English languages.

- Very little systematic data exists on the scope of the problem or its effects on politically relevant beliefs.
Motivation

- We know Latinos are on social media, and that they use WhatsApp more than Whites.
- We don’t know:
  - How are Latinos using social media relative to Whites?
  - How are Spanish speaking Latinos using social media relative to English speakers or Bilinguals?
  - Does using Spanish language social media lead to belief in misinformation?
Motivation

- What are Latinos (English-Speaking, Spanish-Speaking, Bilinguals) doing on social media?
  - Following politics?
  - Consuming misinformation?
  - Consuming political information?
    - From what sources?
  - Talking about politics?
Motivation

- Does what Latinos do on social media impact their knowledge or beliefs?
  - Lead to belief in misinformation?
  - Lead to more political knowledge?
2022 CSMaP Bilingual Election Monitor

Largest study ever conducted of Latino online political activity in both size and depth

- 3,378 respondents with an over-sample of 2,152 Latinos.
- Balanced sub-samples from different language groups: English dominant, Spanish dominant, and Bilingual.
- 5 survey waves throughout the year.
- Digital Trace Data: Twitter, Facebook, YouTube & Web Browsing.
We asked Respondents to:

- Tell us about their social media use.
- Tell us about other media use.
- Tell us about their beliefs in several widely circulating pieces of misinformation.
- Tell us what they know about abortion laws in America post Dobbs.
- Provide Digital Trace Data.
Summary of Key Findings

- Latino political engagement on WhatsApp is greater than it is for non-Hispanic whites.
- Latinos who used Spanish-language social media were more likely to believe misinformation narratives circulating during the 2022 election cycle — including claims of electoral fraud — than were Latinos who did not use Spanish-language social media.
- Latinos were more likely to rely on social media for information about COVID-19.
- Our digital trace data shows that Latinos were more likely to use YouTube as a source of information about news and politics than were non-Hispanic whites.
How We Recruited Our Sample
Sample Recruitment

- We recruited using Facebook Ads in English and Spanish.
- We tried to recruit a sample that was representative of the U.S. adult Latino population on demographic characteristics.
- We incentivized (i.e., paid) people to take our survey.
NYU ONLINE SURVEY
GET $10 FOR A SHORT SURVEY
and the opportunity to make up-to $140
Help improve online information integrity and political knowledge in the U.S.

NYU ONLINE SURVEY
RECIBE $10 AL CONTESTAR UNA BREVE ENCUESTA
Y la oportunidad de recibir hasta $140 (USD)
Ayúdanos a combatir la desinformación política en las redes sociales
Incentivized People to Provide Digital Trace Data:

- Install a web-browsing tracker.
- Connect to a Facebook app that allowed us to collect information on their Facebook activity.
- Share their Twitter-ID so that we could collect their tweets and who they followed.
- Download their YouTube history and send it to us.
How Latinos Use Social Media
Do you use any of the following social media sites?

- Facebook: 95% All Whites, 84% All Latinos
- YouTube: 74% All Whites, 76% All Latinos
- Instagram: 57% All Whites, 62% All Latinos
- Twitter: 47% All Whites, 45% All Latinos
- WhatsApp: 16% All Whites, 57% All Latinos
- TikTok: 30% All Whites, 40% All Latinos
- LinkedIn: 30% All Whites, 22% All Latinos
- Snapchat: 23% All Whites, 24% All Latinos
- Reddit: 26% All Whites, 15% All Latinos
- Telegram: 5% All Whites, 16% All Latinos
- GroupMe: 6% All Whites, 4% All Latinos
Do you use any of the following social media sites?

- **Facebook**: 77% English-dominant, 87% Spanish-dominant
- **YouTube**: 66% English-dominant, 61% Spanish-dominant
- **Instagram**: 61% English-dominant, 66% Spanish-dominant
- **Twitter**: 51% English-dominant, 37% Spanish-dominant
- **WhatsApp**: 33% English-dominant, 74% Spanish-dominant
- **TikTok**: 36% English-dominant, 44% Spanish-dominant
- **LinkedIn**: 25% English-dominant, 15% Spanish-dominant
- **Snapchat**: 27% English-dominant, 20% Spanish-dominant
- **Reddit**: 26% English-dominant, 8% Spanish-dominant
- **Telegram**: 13% English-dominant, 17% Spanish-dominant
- **GroupMe**: 6% English-dominant, 4% Spanish-dominant

1-Yes, 0-No
A Percentage of respondents that follow or like at least one political figure.

- **All Whites**
  - Facebook: 57%
  - Twitter/X: 61%
  - Instagram: 44%
  - YouTube: 25%

- **All Latinos**
  - Facebook: 53%
  - Twitter/X: 57%
  - Instagram: 47%
  - YouTube: 33%

B Percentage of respondents that follow or like at least one political figure.

- **English-dominant**
  - Facebook: 54%
  - Twitter/X: 62%
  - Instagram: 44%
  - YouTube: 23%

- **Spanish-dominant**
  - Facebook: 51%
  - Twitter/X: 60%
  - Instagram: 46%
  - YouTube: 34%
A. On [SOCIAL MEDIA], how frequently do you?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>All Whites</th>
<th>All Latinos</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Talk about politics</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share news content</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View a news account</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Platforms include Facebook, Twitter/X, and Instagram.

B. On WhatsApp, how frequently do you?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>All Whites</th>
<th>All Latinos</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Talk about politics</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share news content</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View a news account</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scale ranges from 1-Never to 6-Several times a day.
Summary

- WhatsApp is used by Latinos to get news and discuss politics far more than by whites.
  - Spanish-dominant Latinos are especially avid users of WhatsApp
- Political activity on social media is relatively similar for both Latinos and whites.
- Latinos are more likely than Whites to use social media and the internet to search for information about COVID-19.
Misinformation Beliefs & Political Knowledge
Misinformation Narratives

• Some people are claiming that U.S. border patrol agents have been giving out social security numbers to immigrants who cross into the United States at the Southern Border without authorization.

• The Department of Homeland Security has confirmed that Venezuela is purposely freeing inmates and sending them to the United States-Mexico Border.

• Vice President Kamala Harris said that Hurricane Ian relief will be distributed based on race, with communities of color receiving aid first.
Misinformation Narratives (Cont.)

- After the Dobbs vs. Jackson Women’s Health decision that overturned the right to have an abortion, Planned Parenthood Clinics have closed down across the country.

- A new study shows that getting the COVID-19 Vaccine can make breast milk dangerous to infants.

- U.S. aid to Ukraine was laundered back to the Democratic Party through the failed cryptocurrency exchange firm FTX.

- The only voting sites in Arizona that experienced issues with tabulating ballots on Election Day during the 2022 Midterm Elections were conservative areas in Maricopa County.
Effect of Consuming Spanish-language Social Media on Beliefs in False Political Narratives

![Graph showing the effect of consuming Spanish-language social media on beliefs in false political narratives. The x-axis represents different narratives such as Social Security (Wave 2), Ukraine Aid and FTX (Wave 5), Freeing Inmates (Wave 3), Maricopa Voting Sites (Wave 5), COVID-19 Breast Milk (Wave 3), Hurricane Ian (Wave 3), and Planned Parenthood (Wave 3). The y-axis represents the first difference, ranging from -0.4 to 0.4.]
Belief in 2020 Electoral Fraud

- Latinos who relied on Spanish-language social media for news were more likely to believe that a state had declared an incorrect winner than Latinos who did not rely on Spanish-language social media for news.
  - This result holds conditioning on age, education, and other demographic characteristics.
Digital Trace Data
By Collecting Digital Trace Data - We can Observe in Fine-Grained Detail What People do Online
Table 1: **Digital Trace Data** — News Following on Twitter, Facebook, and Web Browsing among White and Latino Respondents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Twitter</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>Web Browsing</th>
<th>YouTube</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whites</td>
<td>Latinos</td>
<td>Whites</td>
<td>Latinos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(N=174)</td>
<td>(N=306)</td>
<td>(N=295)</td>
<td>(N=393)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Whites</td>
<td>Latinos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(N=111)</td>
<td>(N=197)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Whites</td>
<td>Latinos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(N=179)</td>
<td>(N=282)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fox News</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
<td>40.5%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.7%</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNN</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>27.4%</td>
<td>28.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5.4%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSNBC</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBS/ABC/NBC</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
<td>10.8%</td>
<td>16.1%</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political News</td>
<td>35.9%</td>
<td>27.9%</td>
<td>73.5%</td>
<td>87.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1+ pages/visited)</td>
<td>70.3%</td>
<td>73.5%</td>
<td>55.4%</td>
<td>72.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political News</td>
<td>12.4%</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5+ pages/visited)</td>
<td>49.3%</td>
<td>38.1%</td>
<td>45.6%</td>
<td>63.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 2: Digital Trace Data — News Following on Twitter, Facebook, and Web Browsing Data Among Bilingual and Spanish-dominant Latino Respondents (Weighted)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Twitter</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>Web Browsing</th>
<th>YouTube</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bilingual Spanish</td>
<td>Bilingual Spanish</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>Bilingual Spanish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(N=79)</td>
<td>(N=75)</td>
<td>(N=99)</td>
<td>(N=114)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNN Español</td>
<td>3.86%</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
<td>24.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telemundo</td>
<td>3.86%</td>
<td>12.4%</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>23.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Univision</td>
<td>3.86%</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
<td>32.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish Political News (1+ pages/visited)</td>
<td>30.7%</td>
<td>24.1%</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
<td>26.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish Political News (5+ pages/visited)</td>
<td>17.2%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Digital Trace Data - News Consumption

- Latinos consume more news on YouTube than Whites.
- Spanish-dominant Latinos and Bilingual Latinos consume about the same amount of political news on YouTube.
- Latinos are consuming large amounts of political news on YouTube, but it is not from the major media sources.
What’s Next
Low Quality News in English & Spanish

To identify when people might be viewing misinformation, we’ve built cross platform lists of low-quality news sources in English and Spanish.

**English Cross-Platform List**
- 2,503 websites
- 1,345 Facebook Pages
- 199 YouTube Channels
- 496 Twitter Handles

**Spanish Cross-Platform List (still growing)**
- 208 websites
- 274 Facebook Pages
- 148 YouTube Channels
- 231 Twitter Handles
Building a Spanish Misinformation List [Low-Quality News Sites]

What we are doing now:

- Began with the list of fact-checked “true” and “false” news articles.
- Automated Google searches for the headlines of each news article and collected the domains for the top 20 results.
- We are having Research Assistants hand code three news articles from the top 150 websites that occurred most regularly in the “false” searches (but not in “true” searches).
- Then, we will have our list reviewed and validated by a third party.
Expanding Data Collection

*Digital trace data allows us to directly capture shifts in digital media consumption*

- TikTok is the fastest growing social media platform and is used by 50% of Latino adults.

- Our YouTube digital trace data indicates that Latinos are more likely to consume news and information on video-based platforms than are non-Hispanic Whites.
Summary of Key Findings

- Latino political engagement on WhatsApp is greater than it is for non-Hispanic whites.
- Latinos who used Spanish-language social media were more likely to believe misinformation narratives circulating during the 2022 election cycle — including claims of electoral fraud — than were Latinos who did not use Spanish-language social media.
- Latinos were more likely to rely on social media for information about COVID-19.
- Our digital trace data shows that Latinos were more likely to use YouTube as a source of information about news and politics than were non-Hispanic whites.
Thank You & Questions